

Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board Minutes January 26, 2005

The Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board meeting convened at 1:31 p.m. (EST) on January 26, 2005 in Conference Room A in the Indiana Government Center, 402 W. Washington Street, Indianapolis by Chairman John A. Goss.

Board members present were Chairman John A. Goss, Vice-Chairman John J. Newman, Jon C. Smith, Donald R. Cochran, Julie Donnell, William L. Selm, Andrew R. Seager, and Harry L. Murphy

Staff members present were Karie A. Brudis, John L. Carr, Paul C. Diebold, Frank D. Hurdis, Shana N. Kelso, Amy E. Walker, Steven D. Kennedy, Malia D. Savarino, Miriam L. Burkett, and Karen L. Hanes.

Visitors present were: Jennifer Matri, Kirsten Vaselaar, William Beinhart, Steph Wealing, Mark Jones, Todd Zeiger, Sue Becker Gilliam, Mark Dollase, Joel Lytle, Laura Minzes, Orbin Ash, Link Ludington, Chris Baas, Dean Illingworth, Carol Ann Schewikert, Nancy Hiestand, and Joanne Stuttgart.

Chairman Goss called for the approval of the minutes of the October 21 2004 meeting. Vice-Chairman John Newman noted that he had made suggestions for National Register agenda item number 10 which were not noted in the minutes. Julie Donnell made a motion to approve the minutes as amended, Donald Cochran seconded the motion and the minutes were approved.

I. Division Director's Report

Jon Smith reported that the O'Brien/Main Street Conference was held in Madison in late October and was the first time the two agency conferences had been combined. The conference had fantastic attendance and near perfect weather. The division is looking forward to this year's O'Brien/Main Street Conference in Lafayette, Indiana on October 20-22, 2005. Jon expressed the hope that the board members will attend this year, as it is a worthwhile educational opportunity. This year Preservation Month (previously Preservation week) will take place in May. Finally, Jon noted that he and Julie Donnell were working with organizations to put together a historic designed landscape conference that will be held on June 9, 2005 in Indianapolis.

II State Certificates of Approval

1. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of Indiana State Museums and Historic Sites for a certificate of approval to alter the Sowers Bank Barn at the Gene Stratton Porter State Historic Site, Noble County Indiana

John Carr reported that at the time the staff comments were prepared and mailed to the board, an application was sent to board members for the Certificate of Approval to alter the Sowers Bank Barn. The Division of Museum and Historic Sites subsequently provided the staff with photographs which also were sent to the board. The staff has concluded that the barn is not historic and therefore the Certificate of Approval requirement does not apply. John Newman made a motion to withdraw the item. Donald Cochran seconded the motion and it carried.

2. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter Turkey Run Inn at Turkey Run State Park, Penn Township, Park County, Indiana

3. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter the Tennis Court Shelterhouse, Big Log Shelterhouse, Middle Shelterhouse and Newby Gulch Shelterhouse at Turkey Run State Park, Penn Township, Parke County, Indiana

4. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter the Saddle Barn at Turkey Run State Park, Penn Township, Park County, Indiana

Shana Kelso reported on projects, 2, 3, and 4. The staff did not have a problem with the proposed work on the Inn. She noted that at the Tennis Court and Shelterhouse, State Parks will be replacing deteriorated firebrick with the same kind of material, matching mortars, replicating the existing joint profile, so the staff had no concerns with this item either.

Kelso indicated that for the most part the staff did not have problems with the repairs to the Saddle Barn. She stated that the staff wanted to know how many windows would be repaired and how they would be repaired. The staff recommended that State Parks check National Park Service Preservation Brief #9. The staff also expressed a concern regarding the low pressure power wash to clean the stable area and suggested the use of a gentler method.

Sue Becker Gilliam responded to staff concerns. After receiving staff comments, the decision was made to use a garden hose in the stable. Sue also reported that the horses tear the windows to pieces, and there are several different types of window. She indicated that she will make sure State Parks has a copy of the brief. John Newman asked if the windows had been replaced before and Sue restated that several different types of window exists.

John Newman moved that a certificate be issued incorporating the staff comments for items 2, 3 and 4. Julie Donnell seconded the motion and it carried.

4. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a certificate of approval for the demolition of the Apple House at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana
5. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a certificate of approval for the demolition of the Orchard House at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana
6. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a certificate of approval for the demolition of the Greenhouse at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana
7. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a Certificate of approval for the demolition of the Salt Barn at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks, County, Indiana
8. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a Certificate of approval for the demolition of the Milk House at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana

Karie Brudis reported on items 4-8. Brudis stated that the staff remained concerned about the demolition of the Apple House and the Orchard House due to the limited amount of information in the report provided. The staff did not object to the removal of the Greenhouse, Salt Barn, and the Milk House.

William Beinhart, who prepared the report for the Department of Correction, addressed the staff's concerns. He stated that the location of the Apple Barn is in the security buffer zone between the facility and the city. The facility has had repeated problems with local juveniles gaining access to the buildings and doing damage. Beinhart indicated that the Apple Barn served no use due to its location.

John Goss asked the board if they had any questions regarding the Apple House or the Orchard House. Andrew Seager asked how long the water infiltration had been going on and what efforts had been taken to fix it. Mr. Beinhart stated it had been going on for a very long time and that no efforts had been taken due to state budget concerns. The funding that the Department of Correction receives goes to those facilities that house offenders. Andrew Seager expressed the concern that under-maintenance was the root of the department's reason to request demolition. John Newman asked if alternatives had been explored to secure the buildings. Beinhart indicated that the Department of Correction has tried to secure the buildings numerous times. Beinhart stated that the main reason that the Department viewed these buildings as a problem is the security concern.

Mark Dollase, Director of the Central Regional Office of Historic Landmarks Foundation of Indiana (HLFI), asked that a letter be entered into the record (see attached). He stated that Historic Landmark Foundation's position is that they oppose the demolition of the Apple House and the Orchard House, and support the staff comments. Dollase indicated that HLFI recognized the condition of the Green House, Milk House, and Salt Barn is poor and they may have to come down. HLFI feels the Apple House and Orchard House are still in good enough condition to be repaired and maintained as part of the Indiana's Boy School Historic District.

Dollase questioned if an architect who works for the Department of Correction can be the one who does the study and not an independent firm. John Goss asked the staff if the state had a policy. Jon Smith was not aware of any policy that existed for the state. John Goss asked for a motion regarding agenda items II – 7, 8, 9. John Newman made a motion that a certificate be granted, incorporating the comments of staff. Don Cochran asked about the district and what comprised this district besides the Apple House and Orchard House. Paul Diebold stated the district was identified in the Hendricks County Interim Report.

John Goss asked if there were any further questions regarding items 7, 8 and 9. There being none, Goss asked for a vote and it carried. Goss asked if the board wanted to continue the discussion about the Apple Barn and Orchard House or table the matter to a later date. After brief discussion, Chairman Goss asked for a motion to table the Apple House and Orchard House request until the next meeting. Julie Donnell made the motion to table until next meeting. The board would like more information and discussion at the April meeting.

III Emergency Action Using State Funds.

1. Stabilization of the Posey House at the Corydon Capitol State Historic Site, Harrison County, Indiana

Laura Minzes, speaking for the Division of Museums and Historic Sites, described the situation. At the end of September, Historic Sites staff noticed the condition of the back addition on the Posey House was getting significantly worse. At that time, Orbin Ash was asked to make a recommendation on emergency stabilization. Ash gave a presentation to the board that included a brief history of the building based on site evidence, and the steps recently taken to stabilize the house.

John Goss thanked them for the visuals and asked John Carr to remind the board what the emergency provisions are. John Carr pointed out the guidelines adopted by board about three (3) years ago that deal with situations where risk of harm to health and safety occurs between review board meetings and some action need be taken prior to the responsible state agency being able to obtain a Certificate of Approval. It appeared that Museums and Historic Sites had complied as much as they could with the guidelines. Goss noted that it appeared Historic Sites had made a good faith effort to meet the spirit of the guidelines.

Chairman Goss asked for questions or comments. Andrew Seager commented that he appreciated the very careful documentation of the work that was done and what was discovered. John Newman asked what specific action the board should take. John Carr stated the guidelines did not require the board to take any specific action, because this is a process that is a substitute, at least temporarily, for a Certificate of Approval. Chairman Goss inquired about the intended end result for the Posey House. Minzes stated they are not sure and the final result will depend on what research turns up regarding whether they put the addition back or just leave it off and try to move forward from there. John Newman made the motion to accept the report on the emergency action. Andrew Seager seconded the motion and the motion carried.

IV. State and National Register Applications

1. Bell Ford Post Patented Diagonal "Combination Bridge", 071-581-30009, State Road 258 1.5 miles west junction State Road 258 and Community Drive, Seymour, vic., Jackson County, IN (1579)

Paul Diebold stated that the bridge is a two-span covered bridge but only one full span is left. For that reason, the staff called the National Park Service. Their comment was that if we feel that one span of the bridge has the engineering to make it significant, we can nominate it as it stands. They also suggested that when the bridge is rebuilt, the staff present it to the Review Board as additional documentation. Paul stated the boundary would include the whole bridge because there are historic features still remaining. Andrew Seager noted that a HAER record of this bridge was done by Ball State students. John Newman made a motion to place the bridge on the National and State National Registers under Criteria A & C. Donald Cochran seconds the motion and it carried.

2. Cataract Covered Bridge, at the intersection of County Road 235W and CR 1000N over Mill Creek in Leiber State Recreation Area, Cataract vic., Owen County (1657)

Paul Diebold stated that the staff feels that the property meets National Register Criteria A & C and recommended approval. Chris Baas gave a brief PowerPoint presentation on the rehabilitation of the bridge. Chairman Goss commented that this was a great save by all divisions involved, especially DNR engineering. He then asked if the board had any questions. Andrew Seager asked the staff to include information about the HABS/HAER record number in the appropriate blank of the nomination. Baas stated that the final National Register quality photos would be taken soon by the Division of Engineering. DHPA and State Parks would also have copies of the photographs. Andrew Seager made a motion to approve the Cataract Covered Bridge under Criteria A & C for the state and national register. Harry Murphy seconded the motion and it carried.

3. Charles Sweeton House, 163-195-15028, 8700 Old State Road, Evansville, Vanderburgh County (1786)

Paul Diebold stated that the property meets criteria B & C and recommended approval. Chairman Goss asked if there were any questions or comments from the board. Donald Cochran made a motion to approve under Criteria B&C for the state and national register. William Selm seconded the motion and it carried.

4. Hotel Barton, 501-509 N. Delaware Street, Indianapolis, Marion County (1800)

Paul Diebold noted that the staff had included comments from the previous board meeting in addition to the current staff comments. Paul stated that the staff remained undecided about the building's eligibility for the National Register but did feel the application incorporated the information that the board requested.

Carol Ann Schwikert who wrote the nomination, spoke regarding the additional information. Carol stated that her client feels the building meets both criteria A & C.

Chairman Goss asked the board had any questions. Harry Murphy asked the staff if Ms. Schweikert's comments changed the staff's assessment. Diebold stated the staff remained concerned about the physical integrity of the building. William Selm complimented the staff for its analysis of a difficult property. John Newman made the motion to place it on the state and national registers under Criteria A & C requesting substantive review by the National Register. William Selm seconded the motion and it carried.

5. Vinegar Hill Historic District, 105-055-77000, both sides of E. 1st Street from Woodlawn to Jordan and S. Sheridan to E. Maxwell, Bloomington, Monroe County (1801)

Paul Diebold stated a couple of issues with this application, the local community is very concerned documenting the various limestone industry related artifacts. Diebold also noted that this nomination had been assisted with HPF grant funds. Staff recommends approval and Criteria A, B & C. John Newman made a motion to approve for the state and national register under Criteria A, B & C. Julie seconded the motion and it carried.

6. Patoka Bridges Historic District, CR 300W from the Gibson-Pike County Line and Bridge #246 over the Patoka River South Fork to the northern abutment of Bridge #81 over Houchins Ditch, Oakland City vic., Pike County (1803)

Paul Diebold stated that this district consists of a segment of historic roadway that connects the two historic bridges. The staff felt this district meets Criteria A & C. John Newman made the motion to approve for the state and national registers under Criteria A & C. Harry Murphy seconded the motion and it carried.

7. Twelve Points Historic District, 167-628-24001-24026, Lafayette Avenue from Linden to 13th Street and Maple Avenue from Garfield to 13th Street, Terre Haute, Vigo County (1804)

Paul Diebold reported that staff feels that this district meets Criteria A & C and recommended it approval. Andrew Seager moved to approve for the state and national registers for Criteria A & C. Julie Donnell seconded the motion and it carried.

8. Dr. Christopher Souder House, 183-510-16028, 214 Main Street, Larwill Whitley County (1809)

Paul Diebold reported that staff feels that this property meets Criteria C. Donald Cochran made the motion to approve for the state and national registers for Criteria C. Andrew Seager seconded the motion and it carried.

V. Grant Applications for 2005

Steve Kennedy reported that 50 proposals were received requesting a grand total of \$1,285,002. This is a record number of grant proposals for a single HPF funding round in Indiana.

Twelve Architectural and Historical Proposals were received requesting a total of \$134,842. Because the funding requested did not exhaust the amount of funding available for the category, staff recommends transferring the remaining \$32,700 to the Archaeological Category. Andrew Seager made the motion to approve funding recommendations and the transfer of funds. Donald Cochran seconds the motion and it carried.

Ten proposals were received in the Archaeological category requesting a total of \$280,234. Five were awarded funding totaling \$133,275. leaving a remainder of \$16,725. Because this amount would not provide a meaningful award to the top-ranked unfunded proposal, staff recommends transferring the remaining \$16,725 to the Acquisition & Development Category. Harry Murphy, Don Cochran, and Andrew Seager recused themselves from consideration of this agenda item. John Newman made the motion to approve the funding recommendations and move the funds as requested and Julie Donnell seconded the motion and it carried.

Twenty-eight proposals were received in the Acquisition and Development projects totaling \$869,926. After transferring the \$16,725 from the Archaeological Category, and allocating an additional \$1,850, eight projects can be awarded funding totaling \$258,275. Andrew Seager made a motion to approve the report on Acquisition and Development and Donald Cochran seconded it and it carried. Jon Smith noted this was the most incredible line-up we have had, and there were some really big impact projects, it was pretty impressive.

VI Properties Listed in, Rejected by, or Removed from the National Register since the last Notification

Frank Hurdis reported that the properties heard during the October Review Board Meeting had been approved.

The next Review Board meeting will be held on April 27 at 1:30 p.m. in Conference Center Room A.

Jon Smith thanked John Goss for all his dedication to the Review Board.

The meeting was adjourned at 2:53 p.m.